

State of New York
County of Fulton
Town of Caroga

Minutes of a Caroga Town Board meeting held Wednesday March 8, 2023 at the municipal building located at 1840 State Highway #10 at 6:00 pm with the following persons in attendance by roll call. The flag salute followed.

Supervisor Scott Horton - Here
Council Member John Glenn – Here
Council Member Barbara Deluca – Here
Council Member Richard Sturgess – Here
Council Member Donald Travis – Here

Tor Shekerjian – Confidential Secretary to the Supervisor facilitated the hybrid meeting using Zoom. Also in attendance were Ralph Palcovic, Caroga Tourism Commission (CTC) member, John Delesky former BTI Director, Planning Board Members Matthew Cooper, Lynne Delesky, and Karen Dutcher, Jeremy Manning – Bike Trail Coordinator & CTC member, Larry Voght – Highway Superintendent, Anthony Fancher – Code Officer, Steve Steadman – Greens keeper, BTI Director Mike Kunath, Board of Assessment Review Member John Livingston, arrived at 7:45 pm. There were seven members of the public in attendance and thirteen people were on using Zoom. A reporter for the Leader Herald was also in attendance.

Council Member Glenn made a motion to waive the reading of the minutes. The motion was seconded by Council Member Travis. All Board members were in favor of the motion.

Department Reports:

Wheelerville Bike Trail – Jeremy Manning reported that the bike trails have been open for most of the winter for skiing, snowshoeing and fat biking. There has been a good number of people using the trails. He thanked Brett Fielding for grooming and Larry Voght for plowing and keeping the area open. Mr. Manning is interviewing for two build positions over the summer. He expects the work will begin in late April or early May to build three new trails and to make modifications and improvements. The Fall Festival will be held the weekend of August 12 & 13. Mr. Manning noted there will be a series of three other downhill races on July 14th, September 16th and October 14th, 2023. He will be renting a timing system from Killington. He is updating the map and the website. He is looking to put together a grant with a New York State Consolidated Funding Application.

Supervisor Horton noted that he sent a letter thanking Mr. McGrath for building the kiosk, and the sign for the Bike Trail, and for the use of the snow dog groomer.

BTI – Mike Kunath reported that nothing much was going on with the snow cover. He has checked a couple of streams and will go out again on Friday. Three people renewed their licenses- they are good for three years. The newest applicator should get her license soon. Supervisor Horton asked if he had any applicants to replace the one retiring applicator. He has just started looking by putting feelers out to people he knows. He will also post something soon. Mr. Delesky was out checking the streams and has found Black Fly larva.

Sole Assessor – Supervisor Horton read from the report submitted by Leigh Anne Loucks Assessor. She continues to finish the property record cards and has entered all the inventory for collections done this year. All valuation and information will be entered by month's end for the upcoming roll. The Equalization rate and level of assessment (LOA) for this year will be 45.8. This should be the last year the rates drop. The pandemic sales have had a devastating effect on the rate. It is a decrease of 6.2 points from where we were last year.

Routine Updates: All exemption forms were processed and into the Real Property System (RPS). The Assessor is finishing data entry and entering sales. She is reviewing the rest of the real estate listings and comparing them to the inventory listed on RPS.

Town Clerk/Tax Collector/Registrar/RMO – Tax Collection Report year to date \$2,561,830.79 has been collected. Leaving unpaid taxes in the amount of \$653,048.10. Penalties collected to date are \$1,534.05. Second tax notices will be mailed out next week per law – 15 days prior to the expiration of the warrant.

The clerk reminded any board that has a standing meeting and it is cancelled to please let her know so proper notice can be posted that the meeting was cancelled.

The clerk noted several more correspondence were received today while she was out of the office. They were from Mary Jablonski, & Chris Milford who sent letters of support for the reprinting of the Caroga Book, and Doug Purcell wrote in support of the resolution for the 10% reduction in taxes for the EMS, and Volunteer Fire Fighters.

Code Enforcement & Sanitation – Anthony Fancher submitted a monthly report. He reported that six permits were issued from 2/24/23 to 3/8/23. The fee amount was \$1,575.00 and a valuation is \$316,500.00. He completed his 24 hours of continuing education training. He is good for another year. He continues to close out permits and give them to the assessor.

Supervisor Horton showed the certificate that Anthony obtained for the three days of training. It is for Code Enforcement and Administration - 5 hours, Uniform Fire Prevention and Building Code - 13 hours, and Energy Conservation and Construction Code - 6 hours.

Dog Control – No report

Golf Course – Mr. Stedman is working in the shop doing regular preventative maintenance. He has fully detailed all of the equipment – air filters, and oil filters. Hydraulic filters are done every other year. Grassland in Latham just called they are all done with the reels. They were sent out to a grinder to be re-sharpened. He is trying to keep a spare set and use one for the year. He had back lashing done. He sent 12 reels out at a cost of \$4,800.00 - \$5,000.00 for them to grind. He will try to keep them rotated. Chemicals have been ordered. He ordered more broad leaf herbicide. Last year he sprayed the front nine holes and the leaves have started to die. He has sprayed the fairways twice out there primarily and the tee boxes. He has enough now to spray all 18 holes, including tee boxes. He has some left over from last year which can be used this year. It gets you a little ahead.

He purchased more moss control for the greens. He will also work to get the crab grass out of the tee boxes.

There will be a few irrigation repairs to be made once the snow melts. It is easier to do if the lines are not pressurized.

He has projects on hole #4, and #10 ladies tee box. Mr. Steadman was in contact with WD Company, the cart company, about the outings for this year and they have said they have carts available on those dates. There are 12 outings scheduled right now. The town also contracted for 10 additional carts for this year. The additional carts will be here before Memorial Day. A benefit tournament for Todd Wheaton is scheduled for July 16th.

The wrap on the pavilion where the carts are stored, ripped with a 20-mph wind. Mr. Steadman thinks he will remove it. Next year he might get plywood. It can be reused on the golf course.

Highway – Larry Voght Superintendent reported that he has been working with the Town Supervisor about the need for a new truck. He stated he needs a new light truck. There are problems with the Chevy 3500's. He has broken five rims on them this year. He talked to his mechanic to figure out why. Mr. Voght stated we should think about upgrading these little Chevy 3500 trucks.

Mr. Voght stated we can purchase a medium size truck with a wing, a plow and sander for \$112,000.00 vs a big plow truck at a cost of almost \$300,000.00. Council Member Sturgess asked what the GVW was on the midsize truck. Mr. Voght did not know. The Towns of Hope and Oppenheim use midsize trucks. Council Members Travis and Sturgess reviewed the specifications on a truck Mr. Voght brought information on to the board and it would be over the weight limit once the sand was put on it. Mr. Voght will check more into it. The trucks will either plow or sand but not have the capability to do both. Mr. Voght still wants to replace one.

Council Member DeLuca asked how we got a truck that wouldn't meet the weight requirements for our needs. Mr. Voght did not know how we got into this situation.

Council Member Travis saw the truck Mr. Voght was interested in buying being used in Lake George maybe he could call them. Council Member DeLuca asked if there was money in the budget for a new truck. He did not know. Supervisor Horton stated that last year there was a final payment of \$36,000.00 on the large truck that a previous administration purchased on time. Last year the budget for equipment was about \$54,000.00. The town put \$36,000.00 in reserve so there is a line item of \$90,000.00. There is also reserve money that has been put away for the last three years for highway equipment. We can't spend all the money at the beginning of the year in case something comes up. Supervisor Horton noted our roads are small. So the Highway Superintendent is thinking about going down to two heavy trucks. Supervisor Horton stated the bigger trucks are used primarily in the summer time and in the winter time for plowing the smaller trucks are used. The smaller trucks do less damage to the roads. He hopes by the next meeting there will be a plan. He did not see this happening all in one year.

Council Member Sturgess thought this might be a good time to go into a lease program with one or two of these trucks. It was thought that you could not lease a truck for our needs. Supervisor Horton stated that CHIPS money can be used to buy highway equipment. Supervisor Horton wondered if the smaller trucks wore out faster than the larger trucks.

Mr. Voght thought there should be a 5 – 7 year program for the vehicles. The buying should be staggered.

Council Member Travis asked Matthew Cooper if the payload could be upgraded from 19,000 with heavier springs. Mr. Cooper had not seen what was quoted but noted GM makes a

4500, 5500, and a 6500 based off that number the GVW increases. Mr. Voght stated that not just the springs need to be changed out but the axels tires, and rims too.

Supervisor Horton noted last month we lost a front end loader. That is another expense out there as far as equipment.

Lakes Management Program – Council Member Glenn read the revised Invasive Species Report submitted by Walter Hogan.

1. APA Permit – A Modified format of our annual report I submitted to the APA was accepted and will allow me to use the format for 2019-2021. Currently working on those reports. Council Member Glenn explained this pertains to the way the town has measured the milfoil removed from the lake. The Town used bushels (laundry baskets)
2. Lake Management Boat – Currently no decision has been made regarding the future of the Lake Management boat used to locate Milfoil beds with the Lowrance Sonar Equipment. I feel the motor is oversized for its purpose. The stability of the boat itself is good so possibly replacing the motor with a smaller size would be the best option. Sale of the current 75 HP motor could possibly cover a good portion of the expense of a new motor.
3. **2023 Season**
 - A. No changes to the February report related to the upcoming Harvesting program
 - B. Grant application for a Pilot program to use an Herbicide to Eradicate Milfoil is in process and will be completed this Friday March 10th.

If approved will provide funding to Contract for map plotting locations of optimum Milfoil beds, Permit applications and the application of a Herbicide by a Federal EPA certified company to the invasive species.

Treatment location will be in the area of the channel around the marina to include the southern area of E. Caroga Lake towards the outlet. This area is shallow water with heavy boat traffic that spreads Milfoil. A second location would be the area dubbed the “Football Field”, a very Milfoil dense section along Vrooman road in W. Caroga Lake. The Invasive Species program will continue to research adverse effects of Herbicides used to eradicate Milfoil, educate residents and along with the town provide adequate opportunities for Public comment.

Time Frame is expected to be:

May-Sept 2023- Permit applications expected to take 3-4 months and map completion.

June 2024 reconfirming locations and application of herbicide.

June-Sept 2024 observation of treated beds, surrounding locations and fish.

- C. Update on the Lake George Park Commission Pilot Program to use ProcellaCOR for Milfoil eradication.

The APA’s permit awarded to the Park Commission has been rescinded by the courts due to improper procedures followed by the APA in approving the permits.

There was no mention that ProcellaCOR was a factor. The judge agreed with the Lake George Association who brought the suit was not afforded equal opportunity to provide public comment.

The commission is reapplying for their permits.

Council Member Glenn explained that the Diver Assisted Suction Harvesting (DASH) Program has been working well for the last 40 years or so. We were one of the first lakes in the Adirondacks to use this method. We find ourselves falling behind despite efforts to eradicate the milfoil. Now the Lakes Management people are looking into ways to augment the program. The APA, DEC and EPA are exploring the use of ProcellaCOR. Next year evaluations will be done on the beds. The Lakes Management committee will meet in May. Council Member Glenn wants people to attend public forums on this throughout the summer. Marcus Harazin was acknowledged for his help in submitting this latest grant application. Due to some technical difficulties the application could not be uploaded by the deadline on Friday. Supervisor Horton stated the town received a lot of letters of support to move forward with this grant. The portal will be reopened for submission of our application.

Supervisor Horton reminded everyone that we are spending about \$90,000.00 on the program. More has been spent in years past and this is unsustainable. It is a big chunk of tax money going to this program. The town may have to spend a little more in 2024 and 2025 to get ahead of this and then we should see the cost going down if this is successful. Lake Minerva has been a real success story. They treated the lake 3 years ago using ProcellaCOR, and the eradication efforts were highly successful. There has been some regrowth. He applauded all the work being done.

It was asked by Mrs. Long if the town does not get the grant will the town proceed with the pilot program. Supervisor Horton stated he thought we would have to. He stated that \$100,000.00 is a lot of money for this town and costs only go up. He noted equipment has to be maintained. Last year money was spent on the barge. We have two boats and a trailer it is an expense. If there is some other way to do it more cost effectively Supervisor Horton thought we have to go down that road. This is the first step and without this grant we don't have the money in the budget to do it on our own. So this would have to be addressed in the fall during budget season.

Town Hall Building – Council Member Travis announced that the BTI office will be moved from the stage area in the gym and into space in the old clinic. There is an office available for his desk and file cabinet.

Supervisor Horton asked about the humming coming from the duplex pump control in the janitors closet in the hallway. Council Member Travis stated it has been doing that for 10 years. He was going to have an electrician come in and look at it. The humming indicates that there isn't a good connection.

CTC (former PLRT) – Council Member Deluca had nothing to report.

Supervisor's Report:

The law suit against the Town Clerk and Town Board declaring the permissive petitions invalid. No decision has been rendered on this. Supervisor Horton stated we are between a rock and a hard place on this. We can't go forward with the town barn project until this is resolved. We can't rescind the resolution. Supervisor Horton thought that later on in the meeting we should go ahead with the maintenance shed with the insurance proceeds to pay for that. The Board had wanted to bond for it so it would have been less of a burden but right now we can't do that. The Supervisor noted the funds can be used for this. "The funds cannot be used to move the town barn because the funds that were received were received for the purpose of the golf course."

Council Member DeLuca asked if the insurance money we received for the golf course building where we stored the carts and now we will use the money to build a building to store equipment but not house the golf club shop. Supervisor Horton and Council Member Sturgess explained there were two separate buildings in the fire, insurance company agreed. They were classified as two different buildings even though they were attached.

The Street Lighting project is complete except for a few things that National Grid has to do like change the billing. They have not done it yet. The good news is they stopped billing the town all together until this is resolved. Supervisor Horton asked the bookkeeper for a snapshot of the town's carbon footprint. She took all of the energy bills for fuel, for the highway trucks, fuel for golf carts, fuel for all of the buildings we have, and all of our electrical bills. In 2022 we spent \$167,000.00 for all of the energy used. The street light bill used to be around \$39,000.00. This street light program is going to reduce this \$40,000.00 bill we have down to about \$3,000.00 he is thinking. That is about a 22% decrease in the amount energy the town is using with just this one program. The program will pay for itself over time. He figured the payback time is now a little bit over three years. He is happy for it and sorry for those who lost street lights on the roads.

Supervisor Horton stated the Salt shed is complete. It came in under budget.

The Supervisor stated that he talked with the Caroga Volunteer Fire Department last week about some ideas for the funding of the fire company. We will probably have some proposals. Ralph Palcovic was invited to do a presentation sometime. Mr. Palcovic stated that with the contract renewal a public hearing was required.

The town did apply for a grant application for funding of the salt shed. A letter came in late but it was denied anyway.

Public Comments and Questions

Lynne Delesky stated she is a member of the Planning Board. She noted on the agenda this evening there is a resolution for a public hearing scheduled for April 12th for changes to the Town Zoning Law. She is wondering what those changes are. As a member of the Planning Board she would like to see the changes before it goes to a public hearing. She asked how we got to the point of a public hearing before the Planning Board got to see what the zoning changes are.

Supervisor Horton gave a quick answer – he was anticipating that there would be a proposal tonight for what the changes would be. He stated he also heard from another Planning Board Member today saying that some of the Planning Board Members were not aware of this. Supervisor Horton stated obviously he was not aware of what the members had or had not been made aware of. The intentions will be to... we know the zoning documents have done the town well but there is a little bit of work that has to be done. Supervisor Horton stated he met with the ZBA Chair, the Planning Board Chair, and Mr. Fancher to get input from all three sides. He thought there would be a proposal tonight that could be read to everybody. We may have to go back to the drawing board and get everybody who should be informed, informed on this.

Council Member Sturgess asked if the town board was going to be informed on this too. He stated he knew nothing about this before today. Supervisor Horton stated sometimes items put on the agenda need more information and it does not come in time.

Lynne Delesky stated the Planning Board needs to be in the loop.

Karen Dutcher also a Planning Board Member stated that the previous speaker said exactly what she was going to say. When we do the new ordinances, whatever they are, which we don't know, she noted the ordinances should follow our Comprehensive Plan. She stated the Comprehensive Plan needs to be revisited and revised. She stated the plan is 12 years old. She has asked many times in planning board meetings if they were going to start working on it. Supervisor Horton stated the recommendation he thought from the Comptroller's Office is that the Comprehensive Plan should be looked at every year. It should be seriously reviewed every five years, and reviewed every ten years and redrawn.

Karen Dutcher stated Al Kozakiewicz – Planning Chairman said just some wording in the first paragraph needed to be changed but she felt the whole thing should be reviewed. Supervisor Horton stated the town board asks the Planning Board to do a revision, and then the Planning Board has to execute it. Supervisor Horton will let Al know that some of the members of the Planning Board were here and see if something can get done on that.

Ralph Palcovic was concerned about the equalization rate. He spent several years as Chairman of the Caroga Assessment Review Board and stated the long-term impact is huge. He noted that COVID had an impact on the valuation/rates. He thought there will be one more year of high market values. Mr. Palcovic noted the need for a reevaluation in the next 12 months. The state sets the rate he noted and the impact to the county tax rate for the Town of Caroga is going to be significant at 45.9%. He believed the equalization rate will go down further next year due to the market. He stated the state will penalize the town if the rate is not at 100% or close to it. He again stated the need for a total reevaluation.

Supervisor Horton responded when he took office in 2020 at that time our assessor was doing nothing as far as bringing the town's inventory up to date. He explained inventory as the town having an accurate record of all the properties and what is on them. That is the first step to doing a reevaluation. You can hire an outside contractor to do it or it can be done internally. We changed assessors and the new assessor is doing a great job in working with codes. He hopes that by the end of this year or sometime next year the inventory will be completed on all of the parcels. This will save the taxpayers a lot of money from using an outside consultant. Then an outside consultant will be brought in to do a reevaluation. Supervisor Horton noted just because you are assessed at a higher amount doesn't mean your taxes go up. The Supervisor continued explaining how the equalization rate works. Supervisor Horton stated when you do a reevaluation the rule of thumb is 1/3 nothing changes, 1/3 goes up a little bit, and 1/3 go down a little bit. It is a long process and we are doing it as cost effectively as possible.

Council Member Glenn asked once the inventory is completed what is the next step. Supervisor Horton stated then there is a board resolution to hire a contractor to do a reevaluation. The contractor/consultant will come up with the true market value of the properties in town. The good news is everyone's property in town is worth more than it was five years ago.

No one using Zoom wished to speak during the public portion of the meeting. At 6:57 pm Supervisor Horton closed the public session.

Old Business:

Franchise agreement with Spectrum Northeast LLC expired in 2020

Supervisor Horton noted the clerk already mentioned about required training for Zoning Board of Appeals, and Planning boards.

Council Member DeLuca wanted to talk about some old business. At the last meeting there was a resolution that was tabled about meetings, and people being identified at meetings, it said in the minutes that there would be some follow up. Council Member DeLuca stated the Town Clerk provided everyone on the board with emails with a decision by the Committee on Open Government, as well as information from the Association of Towns. Council Member DeLuca asked if the resolution was going to be revisited. She noted that Council Member Sturgess had also asked that someone talk to the Town Attorney about this. Supervisor Horton stated what we found is that his desire to have people log in with their names virtually is not legal. It did not change the Supervisors desire to have people act on the virtual as they would as if they were here in person.

Council Member Glenn wondered about doing away with virtual completely. That was part of the conversation. He noted it is not done at the county level. Supervisor Horton believed that the Town of Caroga is the only one that holds a hybrid meeting in the county. Supervisor Horton stated we are the third smallest municipality in the county and we have more people here in attendance virtually and in person than any of the others. He doesn't believe the county has had over 12 guests in three years he has been on the board. He stated we have a lot of seasonal residents in town and they comprise a lot of the property and property value. They are interested and want to be kept up to speed. Supervisor Horton noted the more information we can get out there the better. He just wants to see it done respectfully if it is virtual. He had no reason to change from how things are done unless the board sees it differently. Council Member DeLuca thanked the Supervisor.

The clerk asked to go back to training. She noted it is for BTI applicators, the summer staff, and golf course workers. Everyone has to have basic work place violence training, and sexual harassment has to be done every year. NYMIR, or our insurance company can come in to conduct the training. One year the town held training in conjunction with other municipalities. She noted this is an annual training mandated by law. It was noted it can be done virtually as well. Supervisor Horton wanted to talk about this after the meeting and set up dates for trainings. Supervisor Horton was talking to Jack Wilson the Supervisor of the largest town in the county about how many employees they have. The town of Johnstown has 38 employees. The last time Supervisor Horton counted Caroga has 41 including the part time ones. We have a lot of programs going on in this town. He frequently compares Caroga to other towns. We have the golf course, bike trail, BTI Program, and a summer recreation program. None of the other towns in the county have those four programs.

New Business:

County Attorney advised Council Member DeLuca to recuse herself from discussion and vote on 10% reduction in taxes for fire and EMS.

Reminder about required trainings for town employees.

Supervisor Horton asked if anyone wanted to read the correspondence. He noted the number of correspondence regarding the publishing of the book.

Correspondence:

Fulton County Planning Dept. March 23rd training at FMCC 4 – 8 pm

Upcoming Webinars offered by Office of State Comptroller

2/21 Doug Purcell Pres. Caroga Museum re: Caroga Book

2/22 Allen Farber re: Caroga Book

3/2 email from James Miller encouraging board to adopt the 10% reduction to Fire & EMS

3/3 email from Joyce Barrett in favor of reduction in taxes to EMT & Vol. Fire

3/4 email from Don Clark in favor of reduction in taxes to EMT & Vol. Fire

3/4 email from Allen Farber support of proposed Resolution by Museum re: Caroga Book

3/4 email from Michael Kane Supports reprinting of McMartin Book

3/5 email from John Leonforte & Rosemary Lee in support of a new issue of history of the town

3/5 email from Jim Hine supports reprinting Caroga Book

3/7 email from Karen Reid in support of two part resolution presented by Doug Purcell

Council Member DeLuca went back to new business. She wanted to clarify something. The County Attorney, Jason Bradt who is also the Chair of the Ethics Committee, advised Council Member DeLuca to only recuse herself from discussion and vote on 10% reduction in taxes for fire and EMS due to the fact that she is a member of the Volunteer Fire Department, per general municipal law, she stated it does allow her to participate in the discussion or voting. With regards to the contract, she noted, she can participate. These are separate issues. This was duly noted by the Supervisor.

RESOLUTIONS:

RESOLUTION 2023-025 to approve the permit for Fireworks on March 18th at Royal Mountain and authorize the Supervisor to sign such, was offered by Supervisor Horton at the regular monthly meeting of the Caroga Town Board held on Wednesday March 8, 2023.

WHEREAS, the Town Clerk received an application from Jeff Ward of Salvatore's World-Famous Fireworks LLC 143 Summit Ave. Berkley Heights NJ 07922, and

WHEREAS, the clerk did notify the Caroga Lake Volunteer Fire Chief Howard Dutcher of the application, now therefore be it

RESOLVED, that Royal Mountain Ski Area is hereby approved to hold a display on Saturday March 18th 2023 at dusk, and be it further

RESOLVED, that Supervisor Horton is authorized to sign such permit application in approval.

Seconded by Council Member Sturgess

Adopted by a vote of 5 Ayes; Horton, Glenn, DeLuca, Sturgess, Travis

RESOLUTION 2023-026 to approve donating a round of golf for 4 with carts for Eccentric Club Annual Gala April 21st, was offered by Supervisor Horton at the regular monthly meeting of the Caroga Town Board held on Wednesday March 8, 2023.

WHEREAS, the Town Clerk received an email dated March 6, 2023 from Jennifer Phillips asking for a donation of a round of golf for four with carts from the Nick Stoner Municipal Golf Course as a gift for the Eccentric Club Annual Gala to be held on April 21, 2023, now therefore be it

RESOLVED, that the Caroga Town Board does hereby move to approve the donation of a round of golf for four with carts to the Eccentric Club Gloversville NY Annual Gala.

Seconded by Council Member Sturgess

Adopted by a vote of 5 Ayes; Horton, Glenn, DeLuca, Sturgess, Travis

RESOLUTION 2023-027 to create a committee to recommend a new local law governing short term rentals in the Town of Caroga, was offered by Council Member DeLuca at the regular monthly meeting of the Caroga Town Board held on Wednesday March 8, 2023.

WHEREAS, Council Member DeLuca and Supervisor Horton agreed to create a committee to recommend a new Local Law governing Short Term Rentals in the Town of Caroga , and

WHEREAS, Supervisor Horton recommended that the committee will be comprised of 5 members, Council Woman DeLuca as the Chair, a planning board member, (Supervisor Horton talked to Al Kozakiewicz who said he would like to be that member) codes – Anthony Fancher, supervisor’s office – Tor Shekerjian, and a lay person from the short-term rental community Trent Atkinson, who owns rentals in the town but is not a resident of the town, and

WHEREAS, Council Member Glenn asked to add the name of Dave Hockey to the persons on the committee a resident, who owns a campground at Pine Lake and has four rentals, and

WHEREAS, Karen Dutcher Planning Board Member spoke up and expressed her interest in serving on this committee, now therefore be it

RESOLVED, that a meeting will be set up within the next two weeks with the members being, Chairperson - Barbara Deluca, Al Kozakiewicz, Anthony Fancher, Tor Shekerjian, and maybe Dave Hockey.

Seconded by Council Member Glenn

Discussion: Supervisor Horton stated that anyone can attend the meetings. They will all be open to the public and minutes will be taken. He noted people in attendance may or may not be

enlisted to speak which will be up to the Chairperson. The clerk asked the supervisor if the committee could be expanded to seven persons. The Supervisor replied he did not want to. Council Member Sturgess stated with more people it takes long to get things done. Council Member Sturgess also stated he was interested in serving on this committee. Council Member Sturgess stated this was a very, very important factor in the growth positively and negatively in Caroga Lake. He stated there are safety concerns, there is the business end of it, and also the effect it has on the school. Council Member Glenn stated that he has spoken to Mr. Hockey about Short Term Rentals. Council Member Glenn noted the impact this has on sometimes inadequate septic systems.

Supervisor Horton stated a local law would be proposed, there will be a required public hearing where the Town Board will listen to the public then the town board may or may not at that time pass a local law. If they feel more information is needed it would be postponed 30 days until the next board meeting is how it generally goes.

Adopted by a roll call vote:

Supervisor Scott Horton - Aye

Council Member John Glenn – Aye

Council Member Barbara Deluca – Aye

Council Member Richard Sturgess – Aye

Council Member Donald Travis – Aye

At 7:12 pm the Highway Superintendent leaves the meeting.

For the next resolution the board members were given information put together by Council Member Travis, on leasing a Toyota RAV4 for use by Code Enforcement and the Assessor.

RESOLUTION 2023-028 to lease a Toyota RAV4 for use by code enforcement and the assessor. Funding from A1620-40 was offered by Supervisor Horton at the regular monthly meeting of the Caroga Town Board held on Wednesday March 8, 2023.

WHEREAS, Council Member Travis asked for three quotes for the same vehicle from Steet Toyota Johnstown NY, New Country in Saratoga Springs NY, and Lia in Colonie NY, and

WHEREAS, two quotes were received back, now therefore be it

RESOLVED, that the Caroga Town Board does hereby move to lease a Toyota RAV4 from Steet Toyota 310 N Comrie Ave Johnstown NY 12095 .

Seconded by Council Member Travis

Discussion: During the making of the resolution Karen Dutcher asked what happened to the code truck. She noted that the Dog Control Officer also used the code vehicle. Supervisor Horton stated the town has the white truck.

Council Member DeLuca asked if the quote was on state contract pricing. Supervisor Horton stated it was not, that is why we went out for bids. Council Member DeLuca asked if Council Member Travis searched for vehicles on state contract. Council Member Travis stated he went

to local Fulton County businesses. Once it was decided to go with a Toyota he got three Toyota quotes.

Supervisor Horton stated the town just keeps putting more and more money into this vehicle. Council Member DeLuca is not opposed to getting a new vehicle, but thought we could get a better price.

Council Member Travis stated the RAV4 is the LE model and was the best price out of Chevy, Ford, Dodge, and Jeep. He noted there are two years of maintenance on the vehicle. None of the others have that. Council Member Travis's wife figured the current truck gets 8 -10 mpg. The RAV4 gets 22-30 mpg. That could save the town \$150.00 per month just in gas. So now instead of the vehicle monthly cost of \$438.00 (lease) will cost \$290.00 when you figure the gas savings.

Council Member DeLuca wondered if there was a smaller vehicle that would save even more gas. She noted the Governor has an initiative to use state contract under the Office of General Services Procurement Policy. This information is on a website. They are a more green and have a smaller carbon footprint. It was noted that a four wheel vehicle is needed. Council Member Travis showed the Supervisor a document with vehicles listed on line. Supervisor Horton noted we don't have enough money in the budget to purchase a vehicle, so Council Member Travis thought this was a good way to stop putting money into a 6.7 liter diesel engine. Council Member DeLuca just wondered if the town could purchase something a little more efficient. She noted we would not be getting the highway mileage quoted around town on that vehicle.

Supervisor Horton stated if we did a purchase on state contract we would have to purchase a vehicle and take out a loan. Council Member DeLuca wondered if we could shop for a smaller vehicle that is more efficient there are a lot of them out there, and they are cheaper than RAV4's.

Council Member Sturgess asked about the money in reserves for the weed harvesting program. Maybe the vehicle could be used for that program.

Council Member Travis spoke to the bookkeeper and for the next 8 months the lease would be paid for by the money the town received from putting the truck up for auction. The Highway Superintendent thought the value of the truck was \$15,000-\$20,000.00.

Council Member DeLuca wanted to look for a vehicle that is a little less money and more efficient on gas. She wanted to look around. Council Member Travis stated a car was too low for roads that is why he looked at an SUV. Council Member DeLuca stated the roads are plowed. The Code Officer Anthony Fancher stated there are many times the roads he has to go into, the driveways, are the issue.

Adopted by a roll call vote:

Council Member John Glenn – Yes

Council Member Barbara DeLuca – No

Council Member Richard Sturgess – Yes

Council Member Donald Travis – Yes

Supervisor Scott Horton - Aye

Supervisor Horton stated in order to finance this we have to dispose of the current code truck at Auctions International with a minimum bid of \$15,000.00.

RESOLUTION 2023-029 to dispose of the current codes vehicle at Auctions International, was offered by Supervisor Horton at the regular monthly meeting of the Caroga Town Board held on Wednesday March 8, 2023.

WHEREAS, the board discussed purchasing another vehicle for use by the Code Officer and Assessor, and

WHEREAS, a resolution was passed to lease a RAV4 vehicle for the Code Officer and Assessor to use, now therefor be it

RESOLVED, that to cover part of the cost of the lease of the new vehicle, the current truck being used by the Code Officer and Assessor, shall be put up for auction on Auctions International with a minimum bid of \$15,000.00.

Seconded by Council Member Sturgess

Adopted by a vote of 5 Ayes; Horton, Glenn, DeLuca, Sturgess, Travis

Supervisor Horton stated we are currently spending \$1,000.00 a month to rent one stall to store the golf course equipment. He is concerned about losing the code compliance on the depreciation aspect of our insurance company. It is a good faith effort to the insurance company that we do plan on rebuilding. This would be a step in the right direction. The first thing we have to do is to approve the project and have the bookkeeper set up a K account.

RESOLUTION 2023 – 030 to set up a K account for the golf course maintenance shed, was offered by Supervisor Horton at the regular monthly meeting of the Caroga Town Board held on Wednesday March 8, 2023.

WHEREAS, one of the first steps to rebuilding the maintenance shed is to set up a K account by the bookkeeper, now therefore be it

RESOLVED, that the Bookkeeper Joanne Young shall set up a K account in the amount of \$45,000 in engineering, and \$405,000 for the construction costs with the funding from insurance proceeds already received and a potential of another \$144,000.00 for code compliance that we have to apply for.

Seconded by Council Member DeLuca for discussion

Discussion: Council Member Sturgess asked if Phinney Design was doing the engineering. Is that the quote they gave us? Supervisor Horton stated they quoted us \$450,000.00 to build the building. They take 10% in fees was asked by Council Member Sturgess. Supervisor Horton stated we wouldn't know until we get the final drawings. The Supervisor stated we have to set up the K account. It will be a capitol program with just two items on the expense side one is engineering a soft cost, and then the actual construction cost.

Council Member DeLuca asked about the engineering cost. She thought we already had the design work done. They gave the town a presentation on this. Council Member Sturgess thought the cost was for the mechanicals. Supervisor Horton thought that Council Member DeLuca was referring to the quite a bit of money the town has already spent on engineering costs and would some of that possibly go toward that \$45,000. His answer was probably yes. Council Member DeLuca noted they showed the board drawings. The Supervisor stated they were not drawings we could go out to bid on. All they were was conceptual. They showed elevations, and floorplan but they are a long ways from having stamped engineering drawings which include everything a contractor would have to bid on.

Basically Council Member DeLuca stated we have spent \$114,000.00 since 2020 on engineering and planning, and it is not what we need for this. Correct replied Supervisor Horton. He noted the location of the building was determined by some of those funds, as was the conceptual design. The town looked at five different sites. A lot of that money was for that. Some of that was reimburse by the insurance company. Supervisor Horton stated the dollar amount given to Council Member DeLuca by the bookkeeper is not the full story. Some of that has been reimburse by the insurance company.

Council Member Sturgess noted that Mr. Fincke was able to prove to the insurance company the importance of the location. Using the current Town hall site was the least expensive option. But the redesign of the golf course was not feasible. Supervisor Horton explained this would give the town the engineered drawings to go out to bid, construction management, and construction of the building. This will go in the north east corner of the lot. The salt shed building would be lowered a couple of feet, and the building will be moved about 40 feet. Supervisor Horton stated this will not affect the town barn. The Supervisor noted the building will not hold all of the golf carts. Some will still have to be stored outside. It will hold all of the maintenance equipment. Council Member DeLuca questioned the cost of a half million dollars to move the building. Supervisor Horton stated it would have a new foundation, an office, oil separator, water, heat, insulation. He noted we are trying to save \$50,000.00 or so by salvaging a building that is perfectly good and repurpose it. Renovating it. The architect is purring the town to do it this way Council Member Sturgess noted. The architect said it would be considerably cheaper to take the building and move it vs knocking down the building and rebuilding one the same exact size.

Adopted by a roll call vote:

Council Member Barbara Deluca – Yes

Council Member Richard Sturgess – Yes

Council Member Donald Travis – Yes

Supervisor Scott Horton - Aye

Council Member John Glenn – Yes

RESOLUTION 2023-031 to hire Orion Management to apply for a \$500,000 Community Investment Grant was offered by Supervisor Horton at the regular monthly meeting of the Caroga Town Board held on Wednesday March 8, 2023.

WHEREAS, there is a grant opportunity through Congresswoman Elise Stefanik's office, and

WHEREAS, the estimated cost is 20 hours at \$100.00 an hour to apply for the grant by Orion it could be a little more or a little less, now therefore be it

RESOLVED, that the Caroga Town Board does hereby move to hire Orion to apply for the grant available through Congress woman Elise Stefanik's office.

Seconded by Council Member Sturgess

Adopted by a vote of 5 Ayes; Horton, Glenn, DeLuca, Sturgess, Travis

RESOLUTION 2023-032 to go out for bids for a new pick-up truck for the highway

superintendent, was offered by Supervisor Horton at the regular monthly meeting of the Caroga Town Board held on Wednesday March 8, 2023.

WHEREAS, Supervisor Horton stated the \$90,000.00 was put in the budget for equipment for the highway, and thus budgeted and

WHEREAS, the Highway Superintendent is in need of a new pickup truck, now therefore be it

RESOLVED, that the Town board hereby moves to go out to bid for a new pickup truck for the highway superintendent. The bids or State Contract, will include the trade-in of the current vehicle, and be it further

RESOLVED, that this is not a resolution to purchase a new pick-up truck.

Seconded by Council Member DeLuca

Discussion: It is time for the vehicle the Highway Superintendent has to be replaced. The Supervisor did not know if this was the best time to buy one. It will take a while to get it if it is ordered. This is not a resolution to purchase a truck he will have to come back to the board.

Council Member Glenn stated more information is needed on the weights and capacity. The other board members stated this is a different truck. It was stated that not all of the \$90,000.00 would be used on this truck. Council Member Sturgess asked if we would be financing or buying the vehicle outright. Supervisor Horton replied buying it outright. Council Member Sturgess thought if we financed the vehicle then it would free up money to buy another one ton vehicle. He noted the need to have a plan in place. This is the fifth vehicle the board is talking about tonight for this town. Supervisor Horton stated we have no use for his vehicle so it would be easier for him to use this as a trade in. Supervisor Horton noted we have to be careful about how much the town finances. Right now we have the best rating you can have to go out and borrow money. If we have to borrow we want to get the best rate. If we have too much financing out there it effects our credit rating. We are at one right now. Right now, we have the excavator financed. Supervisor Horton thought maybe the new pickup could be leased.

Adopted by a vote of 5 Ayes; Horton, Glenn, DeLuca, Sturgess, Travis

RESOLUTION 2023 - 033 to allow the Caroga Museum to publish revised second edition of Barbara McMartin's book: "Caroga: An Adirondack Town Recalls Its Past", was

offered by Supervisor Horton at the regular monthly meeting of the Caroga Town Board held on Wednesday March 8, 2023.

WHEREAS, the town received a correspondence dated February 21, 2023 from Doug Purcell President of the Caroga Historical Association and Museum asking for permission to produce up to 100 copies of a revised Second Edition of Barbara McMartin's book: "Caroga: An Adirondack Town Recalls Its Past" and to undertake a project for publication of a Third Edition, now therefore be it

RESOLVED, that the Caroga Town Board does hereby move to allow the Caroga Museum to publish the revised second edition of Barbara Mc Martin's book: "Caroga: An Adirondack Town Recalls Its Past."

Seconded by Council Member DeLuca

Discussion: Council Member Sturgess asked for clarification. He noted he received several emails about this. He asked if the Caroga Museum was paying for this to happen. He wondered why they could not just re-up their inventory. Supervisor Horton stated the town owns the copyright. We have to give permission for them to publish it. He did not understand why so many people are asking the board to vote yes on this. It doesn't seem like it's..... Supervisor Horton felt people were concerned that there would be some resistance for the museum to do this.

Council Member Glenn thought at one time there was a copyright infringement in question. Council Member Sturgess stated that is irrelevant in this particular situation. Supervisor Horton stated at one time, and it has been clarified, there was a question. This goes back to the previous administration. He did not want to get into it. Two boxes (of the proofs of the Caroga book) were given to Mr. Long who gave them to Mr. Farber who is an expert in this, and to Mr. Loomis. They worked on this during 2019 and 2020. Many questions were asked as to who owns this book. It is the town's book. It is our copyright. Council Member Glenn stated no one gave Mr. Farber or the other gentleman approval to do this to make or produce this book. They were supposed to look at it to see if it was salvageable and then come back to the town board with the results. Supervisor Horton stated just to clarify the copyright does belong to the town. The reason the museum wants to publish it.... The supervisor noted, Council Member Sturgess stated he got 40 emails on his phone he wanted to make sure he knows what he is passing please.

Council Member DeLuca noted the museum was going to pay for the printing. They would sell it at a profit. It is not in the resolution but Supervisor Horton stated he was assured that if the town would like to purchase some of these for resale that the town could buy them at their cost. It was noted that this would be an enhanced copy.

Mr. Farber was asked to clarify what was done. He stated "the book has the same text but it has all been revised in terms of redesigning it. All of the images have been rescanned. We have added color illustrations to it." It is the same text but dramatically different images. He stated "and we are just selling the book at cost to the museum." The museum is not increasing it above

the cost of the printing. Supervisor Horton asked if the town could also purchase them at cost if we wanted to. Mr. Farber responded “yes, yes, and Canada Lake Store or any of the other stores in town can purchase it at cost, they can then decide they want to sell it for a higher price and make some profit on it that is fine. That is their decision.”

Council Member Glenn asked if the wax mechanicals were usable. Mr. Farber responded that there were no wax mechanicals. What they obtained from the town were negatives which had been used for offset printing. To do offset printing at this time would have been expensive. For 50 copies it would have been like \$5,000.00. If offset printing was done they would have had to have had 2000 copies printed to make it cost effective. He stated there is not a market out there for 2000 copies. The other problem with what they had was it was fixed. They couldn’t make any changes to it. They have made a digital version of it. That can be basis for any future edition, which is exactly what they would be doing. Council Member Glenn stated all under the town’s copyright. Mr. Farber stated, “We have never questioned the copyright.” He contacted the town clerk two years ago stating that the book was available on the Canada Lake Conservation Association (CLCA) website. Back in 2019 the discussion it was referred to that they were going to make a digital copy. He realized in retrospect that the discussion was not as complete as it might have been, because the whole intention was to come up with a digital version that could be posted on the website, on the CLCA website. He noted it is also now on a Caroga website but it has also been offered to the town multiple times to be able to put it on the Town website, always acknowledging the town’s copyright. Council Member Glenn asked how the sale of the book was going. Mr. Farber stated the book has not been printed so they have not sold any. Their first idea is to order 50 copies. The cost is roughly \$1,600.00. Council Member Glenn said he has seen the book on sale on the internet for \$125.00. Mr. Farber stated we have nothing to do with that.

Adopted by a vote of 4 Ayes; Horton, DeLuca, Sturgess, Travis, Nay - Glenn

As Supervisor Horton read the title of the next resolution a board member was heard to say “you’ve got to be kidding me.” Supervisor Horton replied there is a logical reason to this. The town still would hold the copyright to this third edition.

RESOLUTION 2023 -034 to allow the Caroga Museum to prepare a third edition of the book: “Caroga: An Adirondack Town Recalls its Past”, was offered by Supervisor Horton at the regular monthly meeting of the Caroga Town Board held on Wednesday March 8, 2023 This revised third edition would continue to have copyright ownership the Town of Caroga.

WHEREAS, the concept that is being proposed is that the book become more of a living document that continues to document the history of the Town of Caroga, and

WHEREAS, as more information is garnered about the town that it would be added to that. Now therefore be it

RESOLVED, that the Caroga Town Board allow the Caroga Museum to prepare a third edition of the book: “Caroga: An Adirondack Town Recalls its Past.”

Mr. Farber went back to the second edition and noted when Barbara did the second edition she kept the first 12 chapters identical to the previous one. All she did was add separate chapters at the end and brought it up to date that way. Some of the material in the first 12 chapters was found to be subsequently wrong. For example she said the Stewarts landing dam was built in 1922. What we know now is it was started in 1923 and completed in 1924. The fact that they would be working from a digital copy, they can expand on that and augment with new research. He noted the research tools have dramatically improved since Barbara did her book. The book would be enhanced in terms of the information. It will also update the more recent events as well. Since this has gone public a lot of people have expressed interest to Mr. Farber in being a part of redoing it. He thought there could be some real community interest in developing this new book.

Council Member Glenn asked with all of the changes to Barbara Mc Martin's book will it still be as she expected it to be. Mr. Farber stated it will still be Barbara's book. He put it this way – text books will go through multiple editions and the book will still be under the same author. This is the nature of these types of books they go through multiple editions. Mr. Farber would suspect that “we would stay with the same chapter structure.” “Our plan is to begin work on it this spring.” They would like to have it available in 2026 or 2027 to mark the 50th anniversary of the Caroga Museum. He is hoping to work from the negatives that were available. To get good quality he would like to find the originals of the photographs and rescan them and make them up to date. The quality of the book would be improved.

Council Member Glenn asked for confirmation that throughout this the town maintains the copyright. Another board member responds correct. Mr. Farber stated that's never been in question.

Adopted by a vote of 4 Ayes; Horton, DeLuca, Sturgess, Travis, Nay – Glenn

RESOLUTION 2023-035 to accept the resignation of Mike Voght was offered by Supervisor Horton at the regular monthly meeting of the Caroga Town Board held on Wednesday March 8, 2023.

WHEREAS, Supervisor Horton stated that Mike Voght resigned from the Planning Board last month, and

WHEREAS, the town has not received a resignation letter from him, and

WHEREAS, Supervisor Horton asked Planning Board Member Karen Dutcher if she was aware of the resignation, she replied that it was probably back in December, and

WHEREAS, Supervisor Horton spoke to Mr. Kozakiewicz and asked if he had a resignation letter, to which he stated he replied no and he did not expect one, now therefore be it

RESOLVED, that Supervisor Horton does hereby appoint Mr. John Ivancic to serve out the unexpired term of Mike Voght, with Mr. Ivancic's term expiring on December 31, 2025.

Seconded by Council Member Glenn

Adopted by a vote of 5 Ayes; Horton, Glenn, DeLuca, Sturgess, Travis

Council Member DeLuca noted that Mr. Voght had served on the Planning Board for a long time. Supervisor Horton stated he was on the board several years before he got on the board in 2006. Supervisor Horton thanked Mike for his long service and stated he was one of the longest serving board members. He brought a lot of common sense to the Planning Board. Supervisor Horton enjoyed serving with him. “We owe him a lot of thanks for his dedication.” We are sorry to see him go.

The next resolution was pulled because Supervisor Horton stated he didn’t have anything to tell the board that we are going to have a public hearing about. Maybe next month he stated we will get to that.

Council Member Sturgess made a motion to approve the minutes of the February 8th Town Board meeting. The motion was seconded by Council Member DeLuca. All board members were in favor of the motion, Horton, Glenn, DeLuca, Sturgess, Travis.

Council Member Travis made a motion to approve the bills as presented for audit. The motion was seconded by Council Member Sturgess. All board members were in favor of the motion, Horton, Glenn, DeLuca, Sturgess, Travis.

At 7:55 pm Council Member Glenn made a motion to adjourn. The motion was seconded by Council Member Sturgess. All board members were in favor of the motion, Horton, Glenn, DeLuca, Sturgess, Travis.

Submitted by

Linda Gilbert, RMC, CMC
Caroga Town Clerk

General #'s 42-71	\$19,461.49	Prepaid #'s 52-77	\$29,009.30
General Park #'s 3-7	\$3,012.90	Highway #'s 13-32	\$26,999.42